



REVEALING THE TRUTH

Can the dead hear?

Work file: can_the_dead_hear.pdf
Project: Answering-Ansar.org Articles

Revisions:

No.	Date	Author	Description	Review Info
1.1.1	06.06.2004	Answering-Ansar.org	Chapter 5 added, with chapt 2, 3 & 4 having new subsections.	
0.0.1	04.05.2002	Answering-Ansar.org	Created	

Contents

1. <u>HISTORICAL BACKGROUND AND IMPORTANCE OF THIS TOPIC</u>	4
1.1 THE FATWAS OF THE EARLY SALAFI SCHOLARS	4
1.2 WHAT COMPELLED LATER DAY SALAFIES TO DISTANCE THEMSELVES FROM IBNE TAYMIYYAH'S FATWA?	4
2. <u>PROOF FROM QURAN AND HADITH THAT DEAD CAN HEAR</u>	5
2.1 THE PROPHET SHUAIB'S SPEECH TO THE DEAD	5
2.2 RASOOL ALLAH [SAWW] ADDRESSING THE KUFFAR WHO WERE KILLED IN THE BATTLE OF BADR	6
2.3 DEAD CAN HEAR THE THUMPS OF SANDALED FEET	7
2.4 ALL THE HADITHS OF RASOOL ALLAH [SAWW] IN WHICH HE TOLD THE MUSLIMS HOW TO GREET THE DEAD WHEN THEY PASS THROUGH A GRAVEYARD	7
2.5 COMMENTS:	8
2.6 DEAD ADDRESSING TO THE PEOPLE WHO TAKE THEM TO THE GRAVEYARD	8
2.7 RASOOL ALLAH [SAWW] ASKING PEOPLE TO GIVE COMPANY FOR SOME TIME TO THE DEAD AFTER BURYING THEM	9
2.8 PROPHETS ARE ALIVE IN THEIR GRAVES AND PRAYING	9
2.9 HADHRAT ISA (AS) WILL ADDRESS RASOOL ALLAH (SAW) WITH WORDS "YA RASOOL ALLAH"	10
2.10 ADDRESS OF A SAHABI TO RASOOL ALLAH (SAW) AFTER HIS DEATH	10
3. <u>A PREVIEW AT THE SALAFI PROOFS</u>	12
3.1 QURANIC VERSES SAYING THAT THE DEAD CANNOT HEAR	12
3.2 COMMENTS:	12
3.3 INTERPRETATION OF THE MEANING OF FATIR 35:22	12
3.4 FATWA OF IMAM SUYUTI ON THE ABOVE TWO VERSES, WHICH THE SALAFIES QUOTE ABOUT DEAD	14
3.5 INTERPRETATION OF THE MEANING OF AN-NAMAL 27:80	15
3.6 TEHRIF IN HADITH OF RASOOL ALLAH [SAWW] BY SALAFIES (TEHRIF IN HADITH OF WELL)	15
3.7 COMMITTING SHIRK BY ATTRIBUTING THE CHARACTERISTICS OF ALLAH TO RASOOL ALLAH [SAWW]	16
3.8 COMMENTS:	16
3.9 CONCLUSION:	17
3.10 A REVIEW AT THE CONJECTURE (QIYYAS) OF QATADA	18
3.11 COMMENTS:	18
3.12 THE SALAFIES USING CONJECTURE CARD AGAIN AND AGAIN AND AGAIN	19
3.13 AISHA CHANGING THE WORDS OF RASOOL ALLAH [SAWW] IN ORDER TO DEFEND HER IJTEHAAD ON "HEARING OF DEAD"	19
3.14 LEAVING SUNNAH OF RASOOL ALLAH [SAWW] ASIDE, AND INTERPRETING QURAN AT ONE'S OWN PERSONAL OPINION	20
3.15 A'ISHA CHANGING THE WORDS OF HADITH OF WELL	20
3.16 INCONSISTENCY IN THE BEHAVIOUR OF A'ISHA	21

3.17	CONTRADICTION IN THE OPINIONS OF QATADA AND A'ISHA ON HADITH OF WELL	21
3.18	CONCLUSION OF ALL THE SALAFIES PROOFS:	22
4.	<u>QURAN CONFIRMS THAT RASOOL ALLAH [SAWW] IS SEEING OUR ACTIONS</u>	23
4.1	SALAFI RESPONSE TO ABOVE VERSES	23
4.2	OUR RESPONSE TO SALAFI'S INTERPRETATION	23
4.3	RASOOL ALLAH [SAWW] AND BELIEVERS ARE WITNESS AGAINST WHOLE OF MANKIND	24
4.4	SOULS OF COMPANIONS OF THE RIGHT HAND (I.E. THE PIOUS PEOPLE) ARE SEEING US	24
4.5	PROMISE OF PROPHETS TO HELP MUHAMMAD (SAW) ANALYSIS	24 25
4.6	INSTRUCTION OF RASOOL ALLAH (SAW) HOW TO SEEK HIS INTERCESSION IN HIS ABSENCE	25
4.7	RASOOL ALLAH (SAW) IS AWARE OF ACTIONS OF UMMAH, AS THEY HAVE BEEN PRESENTED TO HIM.	27
5.	<u>MORE WAHABI/DEOBANDI ARGUMENTS AGAINST HEARING OF DEAD</u>	28
5.1	OBJECTION 1 : RASOOL (SAW) DENIED TO KNOW THE INNOVATIONS OF HIS COMPANIONS AFTER HIS DEATH	28
5.2	REPLY: THE INCIDENTS ON DAY OF JUDGMENT WILL HAPPEN IN RHETORICAL FORM	28
5.3	OBJECTION 2: WAHABI CLAIM THAT PROPHETS WILL DENY TO KNOW THE ANSWER THEY GOT FROM THEIR NATIONS	29
5.4	OBJECTION 3 : WAHABI CLAIM THAT HADHRAT ISA (AS) DENY TO BE WITNESS OF HIS NATION AFTER HIS DEATH	31
5.5	REPLY	31
6.	<u>COPYRIGHT</u>	34

1. Historical background and importance of this topic

1.1 The fatwas of the early Salafi scholars

Almost all the great Heroes of our modern day Salafies like Ibn Abi-Dunya, Ibn'Abdul-Barr, al-Qurtubi, Ibn al-Qayyim and ash-Shanqeeti were of opinion that the Dead can hear us.

Even the Shiekh ul Islam of the Salafies was of that opinion. When Ibne Taymiyyah was asked if the dead are aware of living that visit them. He replied that:

"There is no doubt that they are aware of the living that visit them."

And Ibne Taymiyyah quoted the following Hadith in his support:

"The proof of dead awareness comes from two Sahih Books of Bukhari and Muslim in which Rasool Allah s.w. said that when people have buried a dead person and leave for home, the dead can hear the thumps of sandaled feet of those who leave."
Majmuaat-al-Fatawa by Ibne Taymiyyah, vol. 24, page 362

1.2 What compelled later day Salafies to distance themselves from Ibne Taymiyyah's Fatwa?

There came a contradiction in the fatwas of Ibne Taymiyyah. On one side he was of opinion that the dead can hear and on the other side he gave a fatwa that it is shirk to ask Rasool Allah [saww] to supplicate Allah in our favour (i.e. Shafaat, intercession) after his death. According to Ibne Taymiyyah, he[saww] was able to supplicate and intercede us only in his life, but after his[saww] death, he[saww] is no longer able to supplicate/intercede for us.

But Ibne Taymiyyah was unable to solve this question that if Rasool Allah [saww] can hear us, then what prevents him [saww] to supplicate for us after his death, and how it becomes Shirk to do it.

Now, the later day Salafies also believe that all the Muslims, who now ask Rasool Allah [saww] for intercession, or want to visit him in order to greet him become Mushriks. But like Ibne Taymiyyah, they were also unable to solve this mystery that if Rasool Allah [saww] can hear us, then what prevents him from supplicating for us and how it becomes Shirk.

Due to this contradiction in their earlier doctrine, they were compelled to distance themselves from the fatwa of IbneTaymiyyah and deny the hearing of dead.

Later Muhammed ibn 'Abd al-Wahhab gave a fatwa that:

If a person talks to the dead, when praying (for his forgiveness) near a grave becomes a mushrik.

Fat'h al-majid, p208

In fact, the denial of hearing of dead is at moment, one of the Very Basic and Most Important Belief of Salafi brothers, while almost whole of their building of doctrine, due to which they label other Muslims as Mushriks, rests upon it.

So, let's begin with Allah's help...

2. Proof from Quran and Hadith that dead can hear

Quran mentions the Prophet Salih's speech to the dead. This speech was made after his nation had been destroyed.

[Yusufali 7:77] Then they ham-strung the she camel, and insolently defied the order of their Lord, saying: "O Salih! bring about thy threats, if thou art a messenger (of Allah)!"

[Yusufali 7:78] So the earthquake took them unawares, and they lay prostrate in their homes in the morning!

[Yusufali 7:79] So Salih left them, saying: "O my people! I did indeed convey to you the message for which I was sent by my Lord: I gave you good counsel, but ye love not good counsellors!"

Please note that Quran testifies that Salih addressed to his nation who had already been perished by Allah. This shows clearly that souls of the dead can Hear, otherwise what is the meaning of Salih's address to them?. Or do the Salafies think that Salih did a **Useless and Polytheistic** Act (as according to Ibne Abdul Wahab one become Mushrik if one think that they can hear)? And why Allah also mentioned this useless and polytheistic Act in Quran?

Secondly, do the Salafies think that Salih [as] used Loud Speakers in order to let his message to reach each and every dead person of his nation ? No, he [as] did not use any Loud Speaker, yet the Holy Quran testifies that all of his nation heard his message.

It simply shows that near or remote calls doesn't make any difference for the Dead. Their means for hearing are different from the Living and they cannot be compared with each other. And if someone does so, certainly he makes a mistake.

Allah has not told us what these means are, but Quran testifies that dead can hear us irrespective of being close or far away. And it is enough for us to believe in it.

Thirdly, why do Salafies believe that when Salih says to his dead nation **"Ya Qaumi"(O my people)** then it is ok. But when we say **"Ya Rasool Allah"**, then it is Shirk?

2.1 The Prophet Shuaib's speech to the dead

Mentioned in the Qur'an:

[Yusufali 7:91] But the earthquake took them unawares, and they lay prostrate in their homes before the morning!

[Yusufali 7:92] The men who reject Shu'aib became as if they had never been in the homes where they had flourished: the men who rejected Shu'aib - it was they who were ruined!

[Yusufali 7:93] So Shu'aib left them, saying:"O my people! I did indeed convey to you the messages for which I was sent by my Lord: I gave you good counsel, but how shall I lament over a people who refuse to believe!"

2.2 Rasool Allah [saww] addressing the Kuffar who were killed in the battle of Badr

Narrated Ibn 'Umar:

"The Messenger of Allah spoke to the People (buried) in the Well saying: "Have you found out that what your Lord had promised you is true?" then someone exclaimed: "Are you calling out to the dead!" The Prophet replied: "You do not hear better than they do, except they do not respond."

Sahih Bukhari, Volume 2, Book 23, Number 452

Narrated Abu Talha:

"On the day of Badr, the Prophet ordered that the corpses of twenty four leaders of Quraish should be thrown into one of the dirty dry wells of Badr. When he halted at the edge of the well, he addressed the corpses of the Quraish infidels by their names and their fathers' names, "O so-and-so, son of so-and-so and O so-and-so, son of so-and-so! Would it have pleased you if you had obeyed Allah and His Apostle? We have found true what our Lord promised us. Have you too found true what your Lord promised you? ""Umar said, "O Allah's Apostle! You are speaking to bodies that have no souls!" Allah's Apostle said, "By Him in Whose Hand Muhammad's soul is, you do not hear, what I say better than they do." (Qatada said, "Allah brought them to life (again) to let them hear him, to reprimand them and slight them and take revenge over them and caused them to feel remorseful and regretful.")

Sahih Bukhari, Volume 5, Book 59, Number 314

And Anas b. Malik reported that:

Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) let the dead bodies of the unbelievers who fought in Badr (lie unburied) for three days. He then came to them and sat by their side and called them and said: O Abu Jahl b. Hisham, O Umayya b. Khalaf, O Utba b. Rab'ila, O Shaiba b. Rabi'a, have you not found what your Lord had promised with you to be correct? As for me, I have found the promises of my Lord to be (perfectly) correct. Umar listened to the words of Allah's Apostle (may peace be upon him) and said: Allah's Messenger, how do they listen and respond to you? They are dead and their bodies have decayed. Thereupon he (the Holy Prophet) said: By Him in Whose Hand is my life, what I am saying to them, even you cannot hear more distinctly than they, but they lack the power to reply. Then he commanded that they should be buried in the well of Badr.

Sahih Muslim, Book 040, Number 6869

Narrated Ibn Shihab:

These were the battles of Allah's Apostle (which he fought), and while mentioning (the Badr battle) he said, "While the corpses of the pagans were being thrown into the well, Allah's Apostle said (to them), 'Have you found what your Lord promised true?' 'Abdullah said, "Some of the Prophet's companions said, "O Allah's Apostle! You are addressing dead people.' Allah's Apostle replied, 'You do not hear what I am saying, better than they.'"

Sahih Bukhari, Volume 5, Book 59, Number 360

Please note that Rasool Allah [saww] is addressing to the Kuffar lying dead in a well and he [saww] is claiming that souls of these non living bodies can Hear better than the living persons.

Just imagine if you are buried ALIVE in a well, could you be able to Hear any voice. If not, then

it has to be admitted that near or remote calls only make difference when person is alive. For souls it doesn't make any difference and they are able to hear the voice irrespective of near/far distances.

The Salafies must check their Double Standards i.e. when Rasool Allah [saww] says "**O Abu Jahl..... O Umayya..... O Utba...**" then it is ok., but when "**Ya Rasool Allah [saww]**" is said then it becomes Shirk?

2.3 Dead can hear the thumps of sandaled feet

Narrated Anas bin Malik:

Allah's Apostle said, "When (Allah's) slave is put in his grave and his companions return and he even hears their footsteps, two angels come to him and make him sit and ask....."

1. *Sahih Bukhari, Volume 2, Book 23, Number 456*
2. *Sahih Muslim, Book 040, Number 6862*

Can anyone hear the thumps of sandaled feet if one is buried Alive in a grave?

2.4 All the HADITHS of Rasool Allah [saww] in which he told the Muslims how to greet the dead when they pass through a graveyard

Interestingly, the Salafies claim that the dead are even not able to hear our greetings. Let's compare their claim with the Sunnah of Rasool Allah [saww], when he [saww] greeted the dead with the words "**Assalam-o-Alaika Ya Ahil Qabur**" whole his life.

(Note: All the references below are from Sahih Muslim, translated into English by a salafi named Abdul Hamid Siddiqui)

Abu Huraira reported: The Messenger of Allah (may peace be upon him) came to the graveyard and said:

"Peace be upon you! (O) the abode of the believing people and we, if God so wills, are about to join you. I love to see my brothers. They (the hearers) said: Aren't we your brothers-Messenger of Allah? He said: You are my companions, and our brothers are those who have, so far, not come into the world."

Sahih Muslim, Book 002, Number 0482

Abu Huraira reported: The Messenger of Allah (may peace be upon him) went out to the graveyard and said:

"Peace be upon you, the abode of the believing people. and If Allah so wills we shall join you.... (and so on and so forth) like the hadith narrated by Isma'il b. Ja'far except the words of Malik: Then some persons would be driven away from my Cistern."

Sahih Muslim, Book 002, Number 0483

Sulaiman b. Buraida narrated on the authority of his father that the Messenger of Allah (may peace be upon him) used to teach them when they went out to the graveyard. One of the narrators used to say this in the narration transmitted on the authority of Abu Bakr:

"Peace be upon the inhabitants of the city (i. e. graveyard)." In the hadith transmitted by Zuhair (the words are):" Peace be upon you, the inhabitants of the city, among the believers, and Muslims, and God willing we shall join you. I beg of Allah peace for us and for you."

Sahih Muslim, Book 004, Number 2128

'A'isha reported (that whenever it was her turn for Allah's Messenger [may peace be upon him] to spend the night with her) he would go out towards the end of the night to al-Baqi' and say:

"Peace be upon you, abode of a people who are believers. What you were promised would come to you tomorrow, you receiving it after some delay; and God willing we shall join you. O Allah, grant forgiveness to the inhabitants of Baqi' al-Gharqad. Qutaiba did not mention his words:" would come to you".

Sahih Muslim, Book 004, Number 2126

Aisha said: Messenger of Allah, how should I pray for them? He said:

"Say, Peace be upon the inhabitants of this city (graveyard) from among the Believers and the Muslims, and may Allah have mercy on those who have gone ahead of us, and those who come later on, and we shall, Go willing, join you."

Sahih Muslim, Book 004, Number 2127

2.5 Comments:

This was the act (i.e. addressing the dead and saying salam to them) of Rasool Allah [saww] , that he did whole his life. Afterwards sahaba, tab'aeen, ulama, fuqaha...each and every Muslim did it. And all the Muslims still are doing it today (including the Salafies themselves). Can anyone still deny that the dead cannot Hear?

Should it to be believed that Rasool Allah did a **USELESS/POLYTHEISTIC ACT** whole of his life by addressing the dead, and he also let his whole ummah to indulge in such a useless/polytheistic act till the time of Qiyyamah?

Secondly, Rasool Allah [saww] entered the graveyard of Baqi'i and always greeted the dead **ONLY ONCE**. He [saww] neither went to each and every grave nor took the dead out of their graves, in order to make sure that they hear his Greetings. And we also, when going to graveyard, believe that saying salam to all dead only once is enough.

It simply proves that Allah has given the power to souls of dead to Hear a near or remote calls. However, this is a power that a living person has not been given by Allah.

Thirdly, those who believe that saying **"Ya Rasool Allah"** is Shirk, must pay attention and importance to the Words of Rasool of Allah [saww], when he always and whole his life said, **"... Ya Ahlil Qabur ..."**.

2.6 Dead addressing to the people who take them to the graveyard

Narrated Abu Sa'id Al-Khudri :

Allah's Apostle said, "When the funeral is ready (for its burial) and the people lift it on their shoulders, then if deceased is a righteous person he says, 'Take me ahead,'

and if he is not a righteous one then he says, 'Woe to it (me)! Where are you taking it (me)?' And his voice is audible to everything except human beings; and if they heard it they would fall down unconscious."

Sahih Bukhari, Volume 2, Book 23, Number 462: Translated by Mohsin Khan

This shows that the Dead can not only hear us, but they are also aware of what is happening in this world. And their voice is audible to everything except human beings.

2.7 Rasool Allah [saww] asking People to give company for some time to the Dead after Burying them

Narrated Amr ibn al-'As:

Ibn Shamasah said: We went to Amr ibn al-'As and he was about to die. He wept for a long time and turned his face towards the wall. His son said: Did the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) not give you tidings of this? Did the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) not give you tidings of this? He (the narrator) said: He turned his face (towards the audience) and said: The best thing which we can count upon is the testimony that there is no god but Allah and that Muhammad is the Apostle of Allah. Verily I have passed through three phases.

.....

When I die, let neither female mourner nor fire accompany me. When you bury me, fill my grave well with earth, then stand around it for a time which a camel is slaughtered and its meat is distributed so that I may enjoy your intimacy and (in your company) ascertain what answer I can give to the messengers (angels) of Allah.

Sahih Muslim, Book 1, Number 0220: Translated by Abdul Hamid Siddiqi

(**Note:** There are several more Ahadith from Rasool Allah [saww] on the hearing of Dead in other sunan and sahad (Ahadith from only Bukhari and Muslim are taken above).

Interestingly, all of them are indicating that the Dead can hear. And not even a single of them shows that Dead cannot hear.

And all of them show that the Dead hear regardless of being near or far away i.e. near or remote calls don't make any difference.)

2.8 Prophets are alive in their graves and praying

Rasool Allah (saw) said:

Allah has declared it forbidden for the earth to eat the bodies of the prophets. So the prophets are living and they regularly receive their sustenance

Ibn Majah narrated this sahih (sound) hadith in his Sunan, b. of jana'iz (funerals) ch.65 (1:524#1636-7), b. of iqamat-us-salat was-sunnah fiha (establishing prayer and its sunnahs) ch.79 (1:345#1085); Abu Dawud, Sunan, b. of salat (prayer) 1:275 (#1047); Nasa'i, Sunan, b. of jumu'ah (Friday prayer) 3:92; Ahmad bin Hambal, Musnad (4:8); Ibn Hibban, as-Sahih (3:191#910); Darimi, Sunan (1:307#1580); Ibn Khuzaymah, as-Sahih (3:118#1733); Ibn Abi Shaybah, al-Musannaf (2:516); Hakim, al-Mustadrak (1:278); Tabarani, al-Mu'jam-ul-kabir (1:217#589); and Bayhaqi in as-Sunan-ul-kubra (3:249).

Source:

 ['Beseeching for Help' by Dr. Tahir-ul-Qadri](#)

Rank of prophets is above the "Shuhada" (martyrs). Allah (swt) made it clear in Quran that even Shuhada are also not dead, but living. But we cannot perceive it.

Similarly, we cannot perceive the means of hearing of Dead in the graves, but on the bases of above Quranic verses and Ahadith, it is beyond any doubt that they hear us.

2.9 Hadhrat Isa (as) will address Rasool Allah (saw) with words "Ya Rasool Allah"

It is revealed that the Prophet (s) knows his lovers and listens to them. Once he said to his companions about Hadrat Isa (s) that he will return to this world. Then Hadrat Eisa (s) will visit Madinah and the Prophet (s) said: And when he (Isa) will stand beside my grave calling: "O Muhammad!" I will respond to him.

Ibn Hajar 'Asqalani, al-Matalib-ul-'aliyah, (4: 23 # 3853)

Source:

 ['Greetings and Salutations on the Prophet' by Dr.Tahir-ul-Qadri](#)

Now it is an invitation to Salafies to issue fatwa of Shirk against Hadhrat Isa Ibn Maryam (as). (Naudobillah).

2.10 Address of a Sahabi to Rasool Allah (saw) after his death

There is a verse of Quran, in which Allah (swt) says:

[Yusuf Ali 4:64] If they had only, when they were unjust to themselves, come unto thee and asked Allah's forgiveness, and the Messenger had asked forgiveness for them, they would have found Allah indeed Oft-returning, Most Merciful.

This verse was used by one Sahabi after the death of Rasool Allah (saw), in order to get his intercession.

In addition, Imam Qurtubi in his famous exegesis al-Jami' li-ahkam-il-Qur'an (5:265-6) has related this happening. He says:.

"Abu Sadiq has reported it from 'Ali. A villager came to see us three days after the burial of the Holy Prophet (s). He placed himself near the Prophet's grave, sprinkled its earth over his body and said: 'O Messenger of Allah, you said and we have heard from you. You received commands from Allah and we received commands from you, and one of these divine commands is wa law annahum idh zalamu anfusahum. It is true that I have wronged myself, therefore, you should pray for my forgiveness.' (In response to the villager's act of imploring) he was called out from the grave: 'there is no doubt that you have been forgiven.'"

Source:

 ['Beseeching for Help' by Dr.Tahir-ul-Qadri](#)

Need we to comment anymore if Dead can hear or not?

[Shakir 60:13] O you who believe! do not make friends with a people with whom Allah is wroth; indeed they despair of the hereafter as the unbelievers despair of those in tombs.

[Yusufali 60:13] O ye who believe! Turn not (for friendship) to people on whom is the Wrath of Allah, of the Hereafter they are already in despair, just as the Unbelievers are in despair about those (buried) in graves.

[Pickthal 60:13] O ye who believe! Be not friendly with a folk with whom Allah is wroth, (a folk) who have despaired of the Hereafter as the disbelievers despair of those who are in the graves.

Aqa Mahdi Puya says:

The last portion of this verse asserts that to believe that the people of the grave have no existence at all and are just dust and decayed bones is kufr (infidelity).

Pooya/Ali Commentary 60:13

Narrated 'Aisha:

(the wife of the Prophet) Allah's Apostle died while Abu Bakr was at a place called As-Sunah (Al-'Aliya) 'Umar stood up and said, "By Allah! Allah's Apostle is not dead!" 'Umar (later on) said, "By Allah! Nothing occurred to my mind except that." He said, "Verily! Allah will resurrect him and he will cut the hands and legs of some men." Then Abu Bakr came and uncovered the face of Allah's Apostle, kissed him and said, "Let my mother and father be sacrificed for you, (O Allah's Apostle), you are good in life and in death. By Allah in Whose Hands my life is, Allah will never make you taste death twice." Then he went out and said, "O oath-taker! Don't be hasty." When Abu Bakr spoke, 'Umar sat down. Abu Bakr praised and glorified Allah and said, No doubt! Whoever worshipped Muhammad, then Muhammad is dead, but whoever worshipped Allah, then Allah is Alive and shall never die." Then he recited Allah's Statement:-- "(O Muhammad) Verily you will die, and they also will die." (39.30) He also recited:--

Bukhari Volume 5, Book 57, Number 19

3. A preview at the Salafi Proofs

Now, let us move forward and see what the Salafies have to say in their defence.

3.1 Quranic Verses saying that the Dead cannot Hear

Following question and answer has been taken from one of authentic Salafi site on Internet, i.e. www.islam-qa.com:

islam-qa.com states:

Question:

My father passed away about two weeks ago. I wanted to know when me or my family members go to his grave, is he able to hear us and what we are saying to him? ... and if not is there any way we can have him hear what we say?..Please respond promptly because I really want to now because I think maybe it will help me with the pain i'm dealing with.

Answer:

Praise be to Allaah.

The principle is that the dead do not hear the words of the living, because Allaah says (interpretation of the meaning): "... but you cannot hear those who are in graves." [Faatir35:22] and "Verily, you cannot make the dead to hear..." [al-Naml 27:80]

3.2 Comments:

My humble opinion is this that unfortunately the Salafies are not honest and they are simply deceiving the normal people. Firstly they deceive by quoting only small parts of above verses (i.e. not the complete verse). And secondly, they misinterpret it in order to prove their point.

Let us see the complete verses of Fatir and Namal, and their preceding and proceeding verses in order to understand them better. After that, insha-allah, we would be able to completely understand the Salafis deception.

3.3 Interpretation of the meaning of Fatir 35:22

[Yusufali 35:22] Nor are alike those that are living and those that are dead. (Only)Allah can make any that He wills to hear (i.e. guide to his message); but thou canst not make those to hear (i.e. guide to his message) who are (buried) in graves.

The word "Hear" in the above verse is figurative (Majaaz) and has been used by Allah in sense of making people to Accept the message of Allah/ making people Hear the message of Allah/

making people to Listen to the message of Allah/ making people paying Heed to message of Allah/ Guiding people to the message of Allah.

If you read the preceding and proceeding verses then you can conclude that Allah is saying to Rasool Allah [saww] that his duty is only to convey the message of Allah to the Kuffar [35:23. You are naught but a warner.] But it is not his duty to compel the people to Accept/ Hear/ Listen to it.

BECAUSE IT IS ONLY ALLAH WHO MAKE IT TO ACCEPT (HEAR) IT (to whom he pleases with).

Just look at first part of Ayah in which Allah says:

...(only)Allah can make any that He wills to hear; ...

This part of verse means that Allah make those people to accept/ hear/ guide to his message whom he pleases with.

Just imagine, you can go to every Kaffir and start speaking with him and let him Hear your voice. But then what is the meaning of these words of Allah that

...(only)Allah can make any that He wills to hear;

If the claim of the Salafies is true that Hear has been used here in literal/real meanings , then there comes a contradiction. On one side Allah is saying that only those can Hear that he wills, but here you are letting all those Kuffar Hear your voice whom you will.

The meaning of verse is crystal clear. Allah says that only the Living persons have a choice of either Accepting or Rejecting the message of Allah.

The people of grave (i.e. the dead) have already lost their chance of accepting the message of Allah. It is too late for them and Allah is not going to give them any more chance of making a selection (i.e. either Accepting it or Rejecting it).

Allah says to Muhammad [saww] that the same is the case with the Kuffar (i.e. like the dead). They are so strong in their Kufr, that Allah has put a seal at their hearts and they have also been deprived of right of accepting the Message of Allah like the dead in their graves.

So Allah Says to Muhammad [saww] that he should not loose his heart when such Kuffar do not Hear/ Listen/ get guidance to the message of Allah. It is because they have lost the right of choice as the dead have lost it. But it is Only Allah who Shows those, the right path whom He Pleases with. Allah says in Quran:

[Yusufali 28:56] It is true thou wilt not be able to guide every one, whom thou lovest; but Allah guides those whom He will and He knows best those who receive guidance.

This fact has also been established by these verses of the Holy Quran in which Allah Says:

[Pickthal 30:53] Nor canst thou guide the blind out of their error. Thou canst make none to hear save those who believe in Our revelations so that they surrender (unto Him).

This verse is very important. Please look at these words of Allah: "**Nor canst thou guide the blind out of their error**"

If we follow the literal way of Salafies, then we have to declare that all the blind people can never be guided towards Haq.

And the next part of this verse makes it beyond any doubt what Allah (swt) wants to say from Hearing in Spiritual sense: **"Thou canst make none to hear save those who believe in Our revelations so that they surrender (unto Him)."**

If someone still denies use of these allegorical and figurative expressions in Quran, then most surely he has erred.

And this figurative use of "Hear" becomes also clear from the following verse where He Says:

[Yusufali 30:23] And among His Signs is the sleep that ye take by night and by day, and the quest that ye (make for livelihood) out of His Bounty: verily in that are signs for those who hearken.

Do the Salafies still think that Hear has been used by Allah here in it's Literal/ Real meaning and there is no Majaz (figurative expression) in Quran?

According to my low knowledge, almost in all the languages there is a figurative use of word "Hear". e.g.

When my younger brother sometimes do not obey the orders of my mother, then my mother complains to my father in the following words:

1. In English: Please you (my father) tell him (my younger brother) to do so and so. He does not **Hear/listen** to me.
2. In German: Bitte sag du es mal zu ihm um das und das zu tun. Er **HÖRT** auf mich nicht.
3. In Pashtu: Tasu aghey ta owaey che zama khabara de **wouri**
4. In Urdu: Aap hi uss ko bolain keh wo yeh aur yeh kar lay. Meri baat to wo **SUNTA** nahi hai.
5. In Russian: ... on "**Slushet**" mene neith...

and in many more languages.

3.4 Fatwa of Imam Suyuti on the above Two Verses, which the Salafies quote about Dead

Imam Suyuti says in his Al-hawi lil Fatawa, vol. 2 p. 169-175:

"It is an Allegorical statement (an-Nafi Ja'a ala m'ana al -Majaz). The Real meaning of this is that "They cannot listen to Guidance (Ma'naha Sama' Huda) i.e. they are dead and cannot be guided anymore."

But unfortunately, the Salafies still believe that there is no Majaaz in the Quran and it is whole Literal.

Narrated 'Aisha:

The Prophet said, "They now realize that what I used to tell them was the truth. "And Allah said, 'Verily! You cannot make the dead to hear (i.e. benefit them, and similarly the disbelievers).....(27.80)

Sahih Bukhari, Volume 2, Book 23, Number 453

Please note that above words in the parenthesis (i.e. benefit them, and similarly the disbelievers) are not mine, but of Translator of Sahih Bukhari, Mr. Muhsin Khan, who is himself a salafi from University of Riyadh. He wants to make clear from these explanatory words that the dead cannot be benefited/ guided as they have lost the right to choose. Same is the case with disbelievers i.e. Allah has put a seal at their hearts and we cannot benefit them anymore by guiding them to the message of Islam.

Do I really need to comment anymore on the Salafies Scholarship? Indeed they know the truth very well themselves, but still they have to deny it in order to defend their other doctrines.

3.5 Interpretation of the meaning of An-Namal 27:80

The Salafies also quote/ misquote the verse 27:80 in order to prove their point (i.e. dead cannot hear). They quote only the part of this verse as under:

[Yusufali 27:80] Truly thou canst not cause the dead to listen, nor canst thou cause the deaf to hear the call...

Again the Salafies are quoting only a part of complete verse and secondly, taking the literal meanings.

I strongly suggest my respectable Readers to read the whole verse with some preceding and proceeding verses in order to get the better understanding of what Allah is saying.

Let me give this full verse with proceeding verse and explanatory comments in the parenthesis.

[Yusufali 27:80] Truly thou canst not cause the dead to listen (i.e. guide them to the message of Allah) , nor canst thou cause the deaf (i.e. Kuffar) to hear the call (i.e. to get guidance), when they turn back in retreat (i.e. when these kuffar are even not ready to pay attention to the signs of Allah. But if these Kuffar (Deaf) pay attention in Signs of Allah then Allah will cause them to Hear (i.e. guide them to) his message).

[Yusufali 27:81] Nor canst thou be a guide to the blind (i.e. Kuffar), from straying: only those wilt thou get to listen who believe in Our Signs, and they will bow in Islam.

It is indeed sad that the Salafies deceive the normal people by playing and misquoting the words of Allah.

3.6 Tehrif in Hadith of Rasool Allah [saww] by Salafies (Tehrif in Hadith of Well)

Very Very Sad. In order to deceive the normal people, the Salafies even don't hesitate to change the words of Rasool Allah [saww] They changed the Hadith of Well in order to suit it to their belief (i.e. dead cannot hear).

The Dead who were killed in the battle of Badr were burried in a well. Prophet Muhammad [saww] addressed them. Upon that, Sahaba asked him if he was addressing the bodies devoid of spirit. He [saww] replied, " They hear better than

you" i.e. Allah caused the Dead to hear his [saww] words as an exceptional case.
Sahih Bukhari, Number 1307
Tafseer (in urdu) of Verse 27:80 in Quran printed by Shah Fahad Printing Complex and distributed by the Saudi Government.

Please note that the underlined words (i.e. Allah caused the Dead to hear his [saww] words as and exceptional case) in the above are not the words of Rasool Allah [saww] But these are the words of Salafi Alim and he added them with the words of Rasool Allah [saww] in order to prove his doctrine and deceive the normal people. Actual Hadith is like this:

Abu Talha reported that Rasool Allah [saww] called to them:

"O Abu Jahl Ibn Hisham! O Umayya Ibn Khalaf! O` Utba ibn Rabi` a! Have you not found out that what your Lord promised you is true? for I have found that what he has promised me is true." ` Umar said to him: "O Messenger of Allah, how do you address bodies devoid of spirit?" The Prophet replied: "By Him Who holds my life in His Hands! You do not hear what I am saying to them better than they do.
Sahih Muslim, Book 040, Number 6869

I strongly protest at it. And I request the Salafies to change their behaviour about the Words of Rasool Allah [saww] I want to remember them another Hadith of Rasool Allah [saww].

Abu Sa'id al-Khudri reported Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) as saying: You would tread the same path as was trodden by those before you inch by inch and step by step so much so that if they had entered into the hole of the lizard, you would follow them in this also. We said: Allah's Messenger, do you mean Jews and Christians (by your words)" those before you"? He said: Who else (than those two religious groups)? And these Jews and Christians were those who altered the devine Texts according to their own Wishes.
Sahih Muslim, Book 034, Number 6448

And it were Jews and Christians who changed the Divine Texts according to their Wishes. Brothers, fear Allah and do not follow the path of Jews and Christians.

3.7 Committing shirk by attributing the Characteristics Of Allah to Rasool Allah [saww]

[Please note that this Salafi Proof is not from Quran and Sunnah, but the Salafies are only using their Logic (better to say that they are using Qiyyas (Conjecture)] The Salafies claim that if it to be believed that:

- + Rasool Allah [saww] can hear us after his death,
- + And Rasool Allah [saww] can hear us even from a remote distance

Then it is committing shirk by attributing the Characteristics of Allah to other than him. It is only Allah who is ever living and only He has the power of Hearing from near/ far distances. In order to believe that Rasool Allah [saww] can also hear us, it should be believed that he [saww] is also Sam'i beside Allah (and it is Shirk).

3.8 Comments:

The same problem of Figurative/ Allegorical and Literal expressions. We believe that Sami'i is the attribute of Allah, but Allah has also the power to give a part of his Characteristics to his creatures (Makhloq). And it doesn't mean that by doing so, Allah makes that creature his Partner in those characteristics. The attributes of Allah are Absolute while of creature are only Given and cannot be compared with his attributes.

Let us seek more guidance and proofs from the Quran in this regard:

Karim (Honour) is an attribute of Allah, yet quran testifies that Rasool Allah [saww] is also Karim(Honoured).

Allah uses the attribute of Karim for himself.

[Yusufali 27:40]..... truly my Lord is Free of all Needs, Supreme in Honour !"

Yet Allah in this same Quran also says about his Rasool [saww]:

[Yusufali 69:40] That this is verily the word of an honoured messenger;

Indeed Karim (honoured), when attributed to Allah then it is in it's literal meaning, and when attributed to Rasool Allah [saww] then it is in it's figurative/ allegorical meaning. Or do you believe that Allah is himself committing shirk by attributing his characteristic to others than him?

Qawi is an attribute of Allah, yet quran testifies that Rasool Allah [saww] is also Qawi.

Allah says about himself in Quran:

[Yusufali 22:74] for Allah is He Who is strong and able to Carry out His Will.

And at the same time Quran says about Rasool Allah [saww]:

[Yusufali 81:20] Endued with Power, with rank before the Lord of the Throne,

Is Allah committing here shirk by attributing his Characteristic to Rasool Allah [saww]?

In fact, there are several times that Allah is be-stowing a mark of honour on his Prophets [as] by attributing some of his Characteristics for them in Quran. For example:

Alim (Knowing): An attribute of Allah, yet Ismail [as] is also remembered as Alim.

Halim (Forbearing): An attribute of Allah, yet Ibrahim and Ismail [as] are remembered as Halim

Shakur (Thankful): An attribute of Allah, yet Nuh [as] is also remembered as Shakur.

Sabur (Patient): An attribute of Allah, yet Ayyub [as] is also remembered as Sabur.

Barr (Devoted): An attribute of Allah, yet Isa and Yahya [as] are remembered as Barr and many more...

3.9 Conclusion:

The same Attributes of Allah have been used By Allah for His servants too. But it doesn't mean

that these servants of Allah have become Shareholders of these Attributes with Allah. They are not the owner, but only given a part of it by Allah out of his bounty and mercy.

The Salafies cannot simply deny these established proofs from Quran and Sunnah by using their Conjecture (Qiyas) only.

When we say Allah is Karim, then it is in Absolute/Real sense. And when we say that Rasool Allah [saww] is Karim then it is not in Absolute and Real sense, but we have to do Taweel (Elucidation) that this expression has been used here in figurative/ allegorical sense.

And if the Salafies are still not ready to accept that there is Majaaz in Quran which needs Taweel, then they surely make all the Muslims Mushrik, along with Allah and his beloved Rasool [saww].

3.10 A review at the Conjecture (Qiyas) of Qatada

The Salafies quote Qatada (a Tabai) that he thought that Allah returned the souls of Kuffar and made them alive as Rasool Allah [saww] addressed their dead bodies at the well of Badr. Let us see exactly what Qatada's opinion/ conjecture was:

... Qatada (a tabai) heard from Anas (a companion), who heard from Abu Talha (another companion), who narrated from Rasool Allah [saww]:

On the day of Badr, the Prophet ordered that the corpses of twenty four leaders of Quraish should be thrown into one of the dirty dry wells of Badr. When he halted at the edge of the well, he addressed the corpses of the Quraish infidels by their names and their father's names, "O so-and-so, son of so-and-so and O so-and-so, son of so-and-so! Would it have pleased you if you had obeyed Allah and His Apostle? We have found true what our Lord promised us. Have you too found true what your Lord promised you? ""Umar said, "O Allah's Apostle! You are speaking to bodies that have no souls!" Allah's Apostle said, "By Him in Whose Hand Muhammad's soul is, you do not hear, what I say better than they do." Qatada said, "Allah brought them to life to let them hear him, to reprimand them and slight them and take revenge over them and caused them to feel remorseful and regretful."

Bukhari Volume 5, Book 59, Number 314: Translated by Muhsin Khan

3.11 Comments:

Qatada is only one of the sub narrator of the above Hadith. He heard it from Anas (a companion), who heard it from Abu Talha (another companion), who narrated it from Rasool Allah [saww]. So firstly, there rises the very basic and important question that how Qatada came to know that Allah returned the souls and brought those Kuffar in the well, to life again?

Rasool Allah [saww] never mentioned that Allah returned the souls and brought Kuffar to life . Umar and other companions, who were present at the Badr, never mentioned that Allah brought Kuffar to life again.

The above Hadith of Well has been narrated on the authorities of companions like Ibne Umar, Abu Talha and Aisha (the Aisha's opinion of Hadith of well is coming later) and others. But none of these companions ever mentioned anything of bringing those kuffar to life again.

So, how did Qatada come to know that Allah brought Kuffar to life? Did he receive a Wahi from

Allah that He swt brought those kuffar to life? If not, then it is only a conjecture of Qatada which has no value in Sharia of Islam.

Qatada's Conjecture is Contrary to the Words of Umar and Rasool Allah [saww]

Umar was confused/doubtful when Rasool Allah [saww] addressed the Dead Kuffar. Please pay attention to the words of Umar.

"Umar said, "O Allah's Apostle! You are speaking to bodies that have no souls!"

And Qatada claims that the souls were returned to their bodies. Which one is between these two right?

And look at the answer of Rasool Allah which he gave to Umar upon his suspicious question:

Allah's Apostle said, **"By Him in Whose Hand Muhammad's soul is, you do not hear, what I say better than they do."**

In fact, had it be a case of returning of souls, then it would have become obligatory on Rasool Allah [saww] to tell Umar about it. The Status of Nabuwwat demands Rasool Allah [saww] to end the doubts of Umar in the matter of Deen. But the answer of Rasool Allah [saww] shows clearly that Qatada was wrong in his Qiyyas.

3.12 The Salafies using Conjecture Card again and again and again

The Salafies have built their whole building of their doctrine in this matter (i.e. if dead can hear) only on the bases of Qatada's conjecture. They concluded from the Qatada's opinion that it was only an Exceptional Case that Allah returned the souls of Kuffar in order to make them hear the words of Rasool Allah, and otherwise Dead cannot hear.

Very unfortunately, the use of conjecture doesn't stop at the above hadith of well only. In order to prove their point, they play the card of Conjecture again and again on all the verses of the Quran and words of Rasool Allah [saww] which go against their point of view.

For example, they say that Hadith of Dead hearing of the thumps of Sandaled feet (Bukhari and Muslim) is Sahih (sound). But they further use their Conjecture Card and claim that it is an Exceptional Case (although Rasool Allah [saww] never told that it is an exceptional case).

Same is true with the verses of the Quran in which Allah says that Shuaib and Salih addressed their nations who had already been perished by Allah. The Salafies playing card of Conjecture and claiming that these were Exceptional Cases (although neither Allah mentioned that these were exceptional cases nor Rasool Allah [saww] ever mentioned it to be an exceptional case).... and so on.

3.13 Aisha Changing the Words of Rasool Allah [saww] in order to defend her Ijtehaad on "Hearing of Dead"

The Salafies also use the opinion of Aisha's on the matter of "Hearing of Dead" as a shield for their doctrine. But my humble opinion is this that it cannot help them while Aisha herself made several severe mistakes in this matter. She made her own Ijtehaad and wrongly interpreted the Quran. But this interpretation/ Ijtehaad was directly against the Sunnah of Rasool Allah [saww].

But Aisha, in order to defend her Ijtehaad, changed the words of Rasool Allah [saww]. Let's see what her Ijtehaad was and how she changed the words of Rasool Allah [saww] in order to defend her Ijtehaad.

3.14 Leaving Sunnah of Rasool Allah [saww] aside, and Interpreting Quran at one's own personal opinion

Rasool Allah [saww] already told about this fitna that only Book of Allah (i.e. Quran) alone is not enough. In order to understand Quran, one has also to take into consideration the sunnah of Rasool Allah [saww]

Rasool Allah [saww] said, **"He who speaks about the Quran on the basis of his own personal opinion (by any accord) he commits an error, even if he is right."**

<http://www.sunnah.org/publication/salafi/troid/answer.htm>

Same thing happened with A'isha when she used her personal opinion in speaking about the following verse of Quran.

Verily! You cannot make the dead to hear (i.e. benefit them, and similarly the disbelievers) nor can you make the deaf hear...(27:80)

From this verse, Aisha concluded that dead cannot hear (We have already discussed at the meaning of this verse. Please see above). And now the Salafies use this Ijtehaad of A'isha as shield to defend their doctrine in this matter. Sheikh Jamal Effendi al-`Iraqi al-Zahawi notes it in his book "The Doctrine of Ahl as-Sunna Versus the "Salafi" Movement":

"It is narrated concerning `A'isha, may Allah be pleased with her, when she heard the hadith about the dead hearing, she denied it and said: "How does the Prophet say something like that when Allah has said: "You cannot make those to hear who are in the graves"

<http://sunnah.org/publication/fajr/fajr.htm>

Here A'isha made the first mistake by neglecting the Sunnah of Rasool Allah [saww] and interpreting Quran at her own. And since, she thought the Hadith of Well to be against her Ijtehaad, showed her surprise on the action of Rasool Allah [saww] (i.e. addressing the dead).

3.15 A'isha changing the words of Hadith of well

When A'isha noticed that the Hadith of Well is against her Ijtehaad, then she changed the words of this Hadith in order to defend her Ijtehaad. A'isha contradicted Ibne Umar and others (who narrated Hadith of Well on their authorities) and claimed that neither the Dead in the well heard anything nor Rasool Allah [saww] addressed them, but he [saww] only said that those kuffar now realize that all that is true what he [saww] used to tell them.

....(A'isha said) The Messenger of Allah (may peace be upon him) stood by the well in which were lying the dead bodies of those polytheists who had been killed on the Day of Badr, and he said to them what he had to say, i.e.: They hear what I say. But he (Ibn 'Umar) misunderstood. The Holy Prophet (may peace be upon him) had only said: They understand that what I used to say to them was truth . She then recited:"Certainly,thou canst not make the dead hear the call...."

Sahih Muslim Book 004, Number 2027, Translated by Siddiqi

And narrated 'Aisha:

The Prophet said, "They now realize that what I used to tell them was the truth. "And Allah said, 'Verily! You cannot make the dead to hear"

Sahih Bukhari Volume 2, Book 23, Number 453: Translation by Mohsin Khan

And narrated Ibn Umar:

The Prophet stood at the well of Badr (which contained the corpses of the pagans) and said, "Have you found true what your lord promised you?" Then he further said, "They now hear what I say." This was mentioned before 'Aisha and she said, "But the Prophet said, 'Now they know very well that what I used to tell them was the truth.' Then she recited (the Holy Verse):-- "You cannot make the dead hear... .."

Sahih Bukhari Volume 5, Book 59, Number 317: Translated by Mohsin Khan

Did Rasool Allah [saww] address the Dead at Badr or not, and did those Dead hear the Words of Rasool Allah [saww] or not?

A'isha, at the time when Rasool Allah [saww] addressed the Dead at Badr, was not present there. But Umar was there and Umar was too suspicious/ confused/ doubtful to what Rasool Allah [saww] did (i.e. addressing the Dead with their names. "O Abu Jahl Ibn Hisham! O Umayya Ibn Khalaf! O` Utba ibn Rabi` a).

Umar asked Rasool Allah [saww], **"O Allah's Apostle! You are speaking to the bodies that have no souls!"** And Rasool Allah [saww] answering him, **"By Him in Whose Hand Muhammad's soul is, you do not hear, what I say better than they do."**

The words of Rasool Allah [saww] and Umar make it clear beyond any doubts that contrary to A'isha's claim, indeed the Kuffar in the well heard his [saww] Words and indeed Rasool Allah [saww] addressed them.

3.16 Inconsistency in the Behaviour of A'isha

And it is 'Aisha herself who started wearing Hijab (veil), when Umar was buried in her house.

It is narrated by Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal that before Umar was buried in Aisha's room, she would go there without Hijab, as Rasool Allah [saww] was her husband and Abu Bakr was her father. However, when Umar got buried there, she would only go in the room with Hijab.

al-Mishkat: Bab ziyarat al-Qubur

Strange, did she believe that dead cannot Hear us, but they can See us? In fact, A'isha made mistake on both the issues of hearing and seeing. If Dead can see through walls of their grave, then what can stop them to see through the Hijab?

And Allah knows the best.

3.17 Contradiction in the Opinions of Qatada and A'isha on Hadith of Well

A'isha was of opinion that neither Rasool Allah [saww] addressed the Dead at all nor did they hear any thing, but he was only saying that they now realize the truth what he [saww] used to

tell them.

Contrary to A'isha, Qatada was of opinion that indeed Rasool Allah [saww] addressed the dead and they heard him. And all that became possible while Allah returned the souls to them back and brought them to life again.

Interesting, the Salafies are using both of these contradictory statement at the same time in order to defend their doctrine.. How illogical is this behaviour. They must first decide who is correct between these two.

Need I to comment any more on their scholarship?

3.18 Conclusion of all the Salafies Proofs:

There is not even a Single Proof from Quran or Sunnah of Rasool Allah [saww] that Dead cannot "Hear". The Salafies have built whole building of their doctrine on the bases of two opinions of Qatada and A'isha (which are also contrary to each other) and their Conjecture Card.

How can these two contrary opinions and conjecture be given preference over all the established verses of Quran and Hadiths of Rasool Allah [saww], which are explicitly affirming the hearing of Dead?

4. Quran Confirms that Rasool Allah [saww] is seeing our actions

There is a verse in the Holy Quran, which confirms that Rasool Allah [saww] is Seeing our Actions.

[Yusufali 9:94] ... It is your actions that Allah and His Messenger will observe: in the end will ye be brought back to Him Who knoweth what is hidden and what is open: then will He show you the truth of all that ye did."

And another verse of the Holy Quran confirms that not only Rasool Allah [saww], but also the Momineen (believers) are also seeing our actions.

[Yusufali 9:105] And say: "Work (righteousness): Soon will Allah observe your work, and His Messenger, and the Believers: Soon will ye be brought back to the knower of what is hidden and what is open: then will He show you the truth of all that ye did."

The above verses prove beyond any shadow of doubts that Rasool Allah [saww] is not only able to hear us, but he can also see us (i.e. he [saww] has full knowledge and awareness of what's happening in the world).

4.1 Salafi response to above verses

But the Salafies deny that Rasool Allah [saww] can see us. They claim that the word "Seeing" has not been used here in literal sense but it is an figurative expression (contrary to their normal claim that there is no Majaz (figurative expression) in The Holy Quran and it is whole literal). The Salafies further say that "Seeing" has been used here in the sense of "Knowing" i.e. ONLY Allah is Seeing our actions and as far as Rasool Allah [saww] is concerned, he [saww] knows it while angels bring him revelation.

Let us see their interpretation of the above verse:

" Seeing in the above verse means (only) "Knowing". It means that not only Allah is seeing our actions, but Rasool Allah [saww] and other believers also get the knowledge of it through Revelation (Wahi). Same thing has been told in the previous verse of 9:94. Here there is an addition of believers too who get the knowledge while Rasool Allah [saww] tells them".

Tafseer (in Urdu) of verse 9:95 in quran printed by Shah Fahad Printing Complex and distributed by the Saudi Government)

4.2 Our response to Salafi's Interpretation

What difference does it make that how Rasool Allah [saww] gets Knowledge of our actions? Making things simple and without going into the discussion of what the means of his [saww] hearing and seeing our actions are(either so, like the normal human beings, or angels bringing him revelation), Main and Important thing is this that he [saww] has the Knowledge and Awareness of our actions.

In both the cases, the Salafies lose their point. How can then they say that:

- ✦ Rasool Allah [saww] is dead and has no connection with this world.
- ✦ Rasool Allah [saww] even does not hear our greetings at his grave.
- ✦ Saying "as-salat o was-slam o alaika ya Rasool Allah" is not allowed, while saying "Ya Rasool Allah" is Shirk.
- ✦ It is shirk to ask Rasool Allah [saww] for his help to intercede us, while he [saww] is now dead and even does not know of what is being asked from him.

4.3 Rasool Allah [saww] and Believers are Witness against whole of Mankind

Quran says that at the judgement day, believers from the Ummah of Rasool Allah [saww] will be brought as witness against whole of Mankind, and Rasool Allah [saww] will be a witness against them.

[Yusufali 2:143] Thus, have We made of you an Ummat justly balanced, that ye might be witnesses over the nations, and the Messenger a witness over yourselves.

And at another place, quran says:

[Yusufali 4:41] How then if We brought from each people a witness, and We brought thee as a witness against these people!

How can be Rasool Allah [saww] and his nation bear this witness against whole mankind when they neither Know nor see them?

4.4 Souls of Companions of the Right Hand (i.e. the pious people) are seeing us

Quran says that souls of pious people are seeing us and greet us at moment when we die (if we are also the from the companions of Right Hand).

[Yusufali 56:83] Then why do ye not (intervene) when (the soul of the dying man) reaches the throat,-

...

[Yusufali 56:90] And if he be of the Companions of the Right Hand,

[Yusufali 56:91] (For him is the salutation), "Peace be unto thee", from the Companions of the Right Hand.

May Allah, we be raised at judgement day as Companions of Right Hand. Amin.

4.5 Promise of Prophets to Help Muhammad (saw)

When we ask Salafies if the dead can help the living, whether they are Prophets or normal humans?

They answer NO!

Then they must see this verse of Surah Aal-e-Imran:

[Yusufali 3:81] Behold! Allah took the covenant of the prophets, saying: "I give you a Book and Wisdom; then comes to you a messenger, confirming what is with you; do ye believe in him and render him help." Allah said: "Do ye agree, and take this my Covenant as binding on you?" They said: "We agree." He said: "Then bear witness, and I am with you among the witnesses."

Analysis

1. Now the Prophets HAD to help Rasulallah (s) as a binding condition of their Prophethood. How could they do that if they were dead and (according) to Wahaby the dead can't help the living?
2. If we say that they can't, then this means that these Prophets were Fasiq since their helping Rasul (s) was the condition of their Nubuwwath.
3. We have to accept that Prophet's whilst not physically alive can still help Rasulallah (s) and come to his aid when he calls them.
4. If these Prophets can help Rasulallah (s) whilst dead then why is it Shirk to believe that the Chief of all Prophets can help us?
5. If these Prophet's can help Rasulallah (s) whilst in Ghaybah (as they were dead) then what's wrong with us believing that Imam Mahdi (as) can help his Shi'a whilst in Ghaybah?
6. If failure to help Rasulallah (s) renders a Prophet a Fasiq, then what's the position of those Sahaba that failed to help the Sahaba in battles such as Uhud, Hunayn, and worse rather than help him openly objected to his request for writing materials on his death bed?

4.6 Instruction of Rasool Allah (saw) how to seek his intercession in his absence

In life of Rasool Allah (saw), Sahaba used to go to him and asked him to do Dua for them. But Rasool Allah (saw) also told us how to seek his intercession, and how to ask through his Wasila in his absence.

A blind man came to the Prophet and said: "Invoke Allah for me that he help me." He replied: If you wish I will delay this, and it would be better for you, and if you wish I will invoke Allah the Exalted (for you)." He said: "Then invoke him." The Prophet said to him: idhhab fa tawadda', wa sallli rak` atayn thumma qul -- "Go and make an ablution, pray two rak` at, then say: "O Allah, I am asking you (as'aluka) and turning to you (atawajjahu ilayka) with your Prophet Muhammad (bi nabiiyika Muhammad), the Prophet of mercy; O Muhammad (ya Muhammad), I am turning with you to my Lord regarding my present need / I am asking my Lord with your intercession concerning the return of my sight (inni atawajjahu bika ila rabbi fi hajati hadhih -- another version has: inni astashfi` u bika `ala rabbi fi raddi basari) so that He will fulfill my need; O Allah, allow him to intercede (with you) for me (allahumma shaffi` hu fiyya)."

It is related by Ahmad (4:138 #17246-17247), Tirmidhi (hasan sahih gharib -- Da`awat Ch. 119), Ibn Majah (Book of Iqamat al-salat wa al-sunnat, Ch. on Salat al-hajat #1385), Nasa'i (Amal al-yawm wa al-laylat p. 417-418 #658-660), al-Hakim (1:313, 1:526), Tabarani in al-Kabir, and rigorously authenticated as sound (sahih) by nearly fifteen hadith masters including Ibn Hajar, Dhahabi, Shawkani, and Ibn Taymiyya.

1. The Prophet's order, here as elsewhere, carries legislative force for all Muslims and is not limited to a particular person, place or time; it is valid for all generations until the end of time unless proven otherwise by a subsequent indication from the Prophet himself, Peace be upon him.
2. The Prophet was not physically present at the assigned time of the invocation, since he said to the blind man: "Go and make ablution," without adding: "and then come back in front of me." With regard to physical absence, the living and the dead are exactly alike, namely: absent.
3. Despite the Prophet's physical absence, the wording (sigha) for calling upon his intercession is direct address: "O Muhammad." Such a wording -- "O So-and-So" -- is only used with someone present and able to hear. It should also be noted that Allah forbade the Companions from being forward or calling out to the Prophet in the ordinary manner used with one another (49:1-2). The only way, therefore, that the Prophet, Blessings and peace be upon him, could both be absent and at the same be addressed is that the first be understood in the physical sense and the second in the spiritual.

Salafies try their best to change the meanings of above hadith according to their wishes. But they cannot, as this hadith has been used by Sahaba (Uthman Ibn Hunayf) in same meanings as we do. Here is this 2nd hadith, which supports the above hadith.

A sound (sahih) hadith authenticated by Bayhaqi, Abu Nu`aym in the Ma`rifa, Mundhiri (Targhib 1:473-474), Haythami, and Tabarani in the Kabir (9:17-18) and the Saghir (1:184/201-202) on the authority of `Uthman ibn Hunayf's nephew Abu Imama ibn Sahl ibn Hunayf:

A man would come to `Uthman ibn `Affan for a certain need, but the latter would not pay him any attention nor look into his need, upon which he complained of his condition to `Uthman ibn Hunayf who told him: "Go and make ablution, then go to the mosque and pray two rak`at, then say (this du`a)," and he mentioned the invocation of the blind man, "then go (to `Uthman again)." The man went, did as he was told, then came to `Uthman's door, upon which the door-attendant came, took him by the hand, and brought him to `Uthman who sat him with him on top of the carpet, and said: "Tell me what your need is." After this the man went out, met `Uthman ibn Hunayf again, and said to him: "May Allah reward you! Previously he would not look into my need nor pay any attention to me, until you spoke to him." He replied: "I did not speak to him, but I saw the Prophet when a blind man came to him complaining of his failing eyesight," and he mentioned to him the substance of the previous narration.

Source:

 [Encyclopedia of Islamic Doctrine](#)

So, Salafies have no chance to distort the meanings of above hadith, and they are helpless.

4.7 Rasool Allah (saw) is aware of actions of Ummah, as they have been presented to him.

Another tradition records that the affairs of the Ummah are regularly presented to the Prophet who expresses his gratitude to Allah for their good deeds and prays to Allah to forgive their misdeeds. The words of the tradition are as follows:

"Your deeds are presented to me. If they are good, I express my gratitude to Allah, and if the deeds are not good, then I pray to Allah for your forgiveness".

Haythami transmitted it in Majma'-uz-zawa'id (9:24) and said that that tradition had been reported by Bazzar (in his Musnad) and its sub-narrators are all of sahih (sound) hadith. 'Iraqi has confirmed the soundness of its chain of transmission in his book Tarh-ut-tathrib fi sharh-it-taqrib (3:297). Ibn Sa'd has recorded it in at-Tabaqat-ul-kubra (2:194). Qadi 'Iyad has inscribed this tradition in ash-Shifa (1:19); and Suyuti, recording it in al-Khasa'is-ul-kubra (2:281) and Manahil-us-sifa fi takhrij ahadith ash-Shifa (p.3), has commented that Ibn Abi Usamah in his Musnad has reproduced it through Bakr bin 'Abdullah al-Muzani and Bazzar in his Musnad who have relied on its narration by 'Abdullah bin Mas'ud with a sound chain of transmission. It has been endorsed by Khafaji and Mulla 'Ali Qari in their commentaries on ash-Shifa, i.e. Nasim-ur-riyad (1:102) and Sharh ash-Shifa (1:36) respectively. Hadith-scholar Ibn-ul-Jawzi has reproduced it in al-Wafa bi-ahwal-il-mustafa (2:809-10) from Bakr bin 'Abdullah and Anas bin Malik. Subki has copied this tradition in Shifa'-us-siqam fi ziyarat khayr-il-anam (p.34) from Bakr bin 'Abdullah al-Muzani, and Ibn 'Abd-ul-Hadi in as-Sarim-ul-munki (p.266-7) has authenticated its veracity. Bazzar's tradition has also been recorded by Ibn Kathir in al-Bidayah wan-nihayah (4:257). 'Asqalani narrated it through Bakr bin 'Abdullah al-Muzani in al-Matalib-ul-'aliyah (4:22-3#3853). 'Ali al-Hindi copied Ibn Sa'd's tradition in Kanz-ul-'ummal (11:407#31903) and from Harith (#31904). Nabhani related it in Hujjatullah 'alal-'alamin fi mu'jazat sayyid-il-mursalin (p.713).

Source:

 ['Beseeching for Help' by Dr.Tahir-ul-Qadri](#)

The only answer given by Salafies is this that this hadith is weak. But it is only their Double Standards. How can they still declare it weak after so many hadith masters authenticated it? Their only standard for declaring it weak is this that it goes against their wishes and doctrine.

Another objection that they raise how Rasool (saw) is able to see the Deeds of millions of people?

A very silly objection and it comes to only those minds, who are suffering from disease of Literalism. Let us quote them only one hadith, which is even accepted by their Salafi Masters:

"Invoke blessings upon me abundantly on Friday because it is a day that is (particularly) witnessed and the angels witness it (abundantly). As soon as a person invokes blessings on me his invocation is shown to me until he ends it." Abu al-Darda' said: "Even after (your) death?" The Prophet replied: "Verily, Allah has forbidden the earth to consume the bodies of Prophets."

Related by Ibn Majah with a sound chain through Abu al-Darda'. Also related with a sound chain from Aws ibn Aws al-Thaqafi by Ahmad, Ibn Abi Shayba, Abu Dawud, al-Nasa'i, Ibn Majah, al-Darimi, Ibn Khuzayma, Ibn Hibban, al-Hakim (sahih, confirmed by Dhahabi), Tabarani in his Kabir, and Bayhaqi in many places.

5. More Wahabi/Deobandi arguments against Hearing of Dead

Wahabi try their best to cast doubts in hearing and awareness of Dead about this world. In this section, we will see which objections they raise in order to defend their beliefs.

5.1 Objection 1 : Rasool (saw) denied to know the innovations of his companions after his death

Wahabi says if Rasool (s) is really aware of our actions after his death, then why he doesn't know what innovations Sahaba introduced after his death. And as proof, they bring the following Hadith of Pond.

Narrated Anas: "The Prophet said, 'Some of my companions will come to me at my Lake Fount, and after I recognize them, they will then be taken away from me, whereupon I will say, 'My companions!' Then it will be said, 'You do not know what they innovated (new things) in the religion after you.'

Translation of Sahih Bukhari, To make the Heart Tender (Ar-Riqaq), Volume 8, Book 76, Number 584

From this hadith, they want to prove that Rasool (s) didn't know what happened after his death.

5.2 Reply: The Incidents on day of Judgment will happen in Rhetorical Form

This problem is occurring while Wahabites are suffering from disease of Literalism and unable to differentiate between Literal and Figurative expressions. It is a very wrong interpretation which Wahabites conclude from this Hadith. That is why Rasool (s) ordered us to get guidance from Ahle-Bait (as).

If we take whole Quran and Sunnah of Rasool (s) into consideration, then we will come to know that all the incidents on the Day of Judgment will be happening in **Rhetorical Form**.

But what is this Rhetorical Form?

Let us clear this term first, so that people can understand this in better way.

A Rhetorical question is a question, wherein the inquisitor already knows the answer. And it is asked in order to make the things clear to all.

All the incidents, which will take place on Judgment Day, are based on this Rhetorical Questioning, and there are several proofs for this in Quran. So, before going in details of this "Hadith of Pond", let us quote an example from Quran.

Allah (swt) is a knower of each and everything, either it is apparent or hidden. But still Allah (swt) will ask such a Rhetorical question to Isa (as), in order to make things clear for all and to establish the witnesses.

[Yusufali 5:116] And behold! Allah will say: "O Jesus the son of Mary! Didst thou say unto men, worship me and my mother as gods in derogation of Allah'?"

Indeed Allah already knew that Isa (as) never said to men to worship him or his mother as gods and Allah (swt) already know this. But since all the things will happen in Rhetorical form

on Day of Judgment, so Allah asked this question, in order to establish the witness to this.

And in answer to this Rhetorical question, Hadhrat Isa (as) will reply:

[Yusufali 5:116]He will say: "Glory to Thee! never could I say what I had no right (to say). Had I said such a thing, thou wouldst indeed have known it. Thou knowest what is in my heart, Thou I know not what is in Thine. For Thou knowest in full all that is hidden.

Didn't Allah know himself that He must be knowing all the things? Did he really need an answer from Isa (as) to make this fact clear to Him? No, surely not. But Allah (swt) will give a chance to Isa (as) to defend the charges upon him, and Isa (as) will make Allah too a witness upon his rightful actions.

Even Hafidh Ibn Kathir presented this same commentary on this verse. He writes:

Allah's statement,

(("Glory be to You! It was not for me to say what I had no right (to say)..."))

contains Allah's direction for 'Isa to utter the perfect answer. Ibn Abi Hatim recorded that Abu Hurayrah said, "Isa will be taught this argument in reply to what Allah will ask him.

Tafsir Ibn Kathir, 5:116

Now let's return to hadith of Pond. Just look at the words of hadith once again:

"The Prophet said, 'Some of my companions will come to me at my Lake Fount, and after I recognize them, they will then be taken away from me, whereupon I will say, 'My companions!'

So, Rasool Allah (s) has already been told in this world that his Sahaba are going to introduce innovations in religion after him, and that at the Fount of Kawthar, they will be brought on left side by angels, and he will recognize them, and then they will be taken away.... . So the question is:

1. Why Rasool Allah (saw) say that he will recognize them and still he will shout for them (in order to save them) "My companions"?
2. And why Rasool (saw) will be told a thing which he already know (i.e. they changed the religion)?

So believe it that at the day of Judgment, Rasool Allah (saw) already know that these companions will be taken to left side, and he already know what's the reason for this. And when this scenario takes place, then it is only in rhetorical form (i.e. to make things clear to others and to establish the witness).

But since Wahabies believe whole Quran to be literal, and all the incidents on judgment day in the literal sense, so they cannot understand this hadith too.

5.3 Objection 2: Wahabi claim that Prophets will deny to know the answer they got from their nations

Wahabies / Deobandies also cite the following verse of Quran, in order to prove that earlier Prophets also knew nothing.

[Yusufali 5:109] One day will Allah gather the messengers together, and ask: "What was the response ye received (from men to your teaching)?" They will say: "We have no knowledge: it is Thou Who knowest in full all that is hidden."

From this verse too, they try to prove that earlier prophets also didn't know what answer they received from their followers.

This verse has nothing to do with the "Hearing and Awareness" of death, as Wahabi try to link it with this issue. Please make it clear that this verse is not talking about the message what was given by their nations after their death, but Allah is asking them about the message what they received in their lifes. (i.e. there is no where talk of message after the death).

But then why Prophets are saying that they have no knowledge of this. In order to know it, we must keep in minds the horrible happenings of the Day of Judgment. Ibn Kathir says in the commentary of this verse:

(We have no knowledge)

is the result of the horror of that Day, according to Mujahid, Al-Hasan Al-Basri and As-Suddi. `Abdur-Razzaq narrated that Ath-Thawri said that Al-A`mash said that Mujahid said about the Ayah,

(On the Day when Allah will gather the Messengers together and say to them: "What was the response you received") They will become afraid and reply,

(We have no knowledge. ...)

Ibn Jarir and Ibn Abi Hatim also recorded this explanation. `Ali bin Abi Talhah said that Ibn `Abbas commented on the Ayah,

(On the Day when Allah will gather the Messengers together and say to them: "What was the response you received (from men to your teaching)'

They will say: "We have no knowledge, verily, only You are the Knower of all that is hidden." "They will say to the Lord, Most Honored, `We have no knowledge beyond what we know, and even that, You have more knowledge of them than us." This response is out of respect before the Lord, Most Honored, and it means, we have no knowledge compared to Your encompassing knowledge. Therefore, our knowledge only grasped the visible behavior of these people, not the secrets of their hearts. You are the Knower of everything, Who has encompassing knowledge of all things, and our knowledge compared to Your knowledge is similar to not having any knowledge at all.

Similarly, Agha Mehdi Poya also gave the following Tafsir of this verse:

La ilma lana does not mean "We do not know anything", but it means "the knowledge we have is not ours, it is Yours, gifted to us by You, and that too is limited. You are the infinite, omniscient".

So this verse is not dealing about the incidents after the death of prophets, but during their life and cannot be used to deny the "Hearing" or "Awareness" of Dead.

5.4 Objection 3 : Wahabi claim that Hadhrat Isa (as) deny to be witness of his nation after his death

The 3rd objection by Wahabies / Deobandies is this that Isa (as) also said that he was not witness of actions of his nation after his death. They quote the following Quranic verse as a proof.

[Yusufali 5:116-117] And behold! Allah will say: "O Jesus the son of Mary! Didst thou say unto men, worship me and my mother as gods in derogation of Allah?" He will say: "Glory to Thee! never could I say what I had no right (to say). Had I said such a thing, thou wouldst indeed have known it. Thou knowest what is in my heart, Thou I know not what is in Thine. For Thou knowest in full all that is hidden."Never said I to them aught except what Thou didst command me to say, to wit, 'worship Allah, my Lord and your Lord'; and I was a witness over them whilst I dwelt amongst them; when Thou didst take me up Thou wast the Watcher over them, and Thou art a witness to all things.

So from this verse, Salafies/Wabahies conclude that Hadhrat Isa (as) was unaware of the Deeds of his nation after his death. That is why he is saying that he was witness only when he dwelt among them. And after that, he was unaware of the Deeds of his nation and hence it is wrong to say that Prophet Muhammad (saw) is also aware of our actions after his death.

5.5 Reply

Salafies cannot cite the incidents on the Day of Resurrection in order to prove that Prophets are unaware of our Deeds, while all these things are happening there in "Rhetorical" form, in order to make things clear to Kuffar, and only these things are mentioned which happened in this world (i.e. account of only those actions/deeds are taken into consideration, which we did in this world. And all those things, which happened Spiritually in this world, they would not be mentioned at that stage.

If Salafies don't accept this fact and keep on sticking to their Conjectures, then we will show them how many contradictions are going to occur in Quran.

Problem with Wahabies is this that they take only one part of Quran which suits to their ideas, while leaving the other. The only right understanding of Quran can come through Ahle-Bait (as).

Before we proceed further, it is necessary to understand what Salafies understand from being "Witness".

For example, let's see the following verse of Quran:

[Pickthal 4:41] But how (will it be with them) when We bring of every people a witness, and We bring thee (O Muhammad) a witness against these?

And similarly the following verse:

[Pickthal 2:143] Thus We have appointed you a middle nation, that ye may be witnesses against mankind, and that the messenger may be a witness against you.

Common Muslim understanding is this that Shahid means a witness, and when ala follows shahid it means a raqib or muhaymin (a close watcher and a careful observer). Please refer to al-Baqarah: 143. Also refer to al-Rad: 43; al-Hud: 17; al-Nahl: 84 and 89. Allah shall bring, from among every people, a witness, and bring the Holy Prophet as a witness over those witnesses.

So it is a blasphemy to say that he is not aware of our actions.

But contrary to this Muslim Understanding, Salafies claim that Rasool Allah (saww) never observed the actions of his nation or previous nations. And he became Shahid (witness) only due to Quran i.e. Allah told the stories of earlier nations in Quran. And Rasool Allah (saw) will give that witness on the bases of this knowledge of Quran.

The Saudi published Urdu Quran with Urdu translation and Tafseer, writes in the Tafseer of above mentioned verse 4:41 that:

"Every Prophet will say to Allah that they gave His message to their respective nations. And if they didn't accept it then it was not our fault. Upon that Prophet Muhammad (saw) will come forward and witness: "Ya Allah, they are telling the truth." Rasool Allah (saw) will give this witness on the bases of Quran, which was revealed on him and it is telling the stories of earlier Nations."

If it has become clear to our Readers what Salafies think about "Witness", then we can proceed forward.

[Pickthal 4:159] There is not one of the People of the Scripture but will believe in him before his death, and on the Day of Resurrection he will be a witness against them -

In this verse, Allah (swt) is confirming that Hadhrat Isa (as) is "Witness" to each and every Christian and Jew till the day of Qiyammah.

Even if we look at the Salafi doctrine of "Witness", again Hadhrat Isa (as) would be knowing about his nation, while near the end of this universe, he will again descend to this world and pray behind Imam Mahdi (as). And Quran will there with all the stories of earlier nations.

So, this fact is beyond any doubt that Hadhrat Isa (as) is aware of the actions of his nation, and will be a "Witness" of this on Day of Judgment.

Now situation is this that if we have to follow the Salafi Doctrine of Literalism, then we have contradictions in the following two Quranic Verses:

1. Verse [5:117] says that Isa (as) will say on day of judgment: **"... I was a witness over them whilst I dwelt amongst them"**
2. But in verse [4:159], Allah is denying Hadhrat Isa (as) and saying that **he (Isa) will be a witness over each and every Christian and Jew that will come till Qiyammah"**
3. And also according to the Salafi theory of giving witness, we have to declare Hadhrat Isa (as) to be a lair (naudobillah) when he will say that he doesn't know about what they did after his death, and he was witness only when he dwelt among them.
(While he came later in this world and had Quran, which was full of stories of his nation).

Dear Readers, we hope you would have been able now to see the results of following Salafi doctrine of Literalism.

And as we stated earlier, the things are happening in "Rhetorical" form on the day of Judgment. When Hadhrat Isa (as) said that he was witness only when he dwelt among them, then it means that he was responsible for his duties while he was among his nation. And as Allah (swt) took him up to the heavens, then he was no more responsible for the Deeds of his nation.

And on the day of Judgment, when account of our Deeds are taken, then only those things are

mentioned which practically happened in this world. But no account will be taken of those things, which happened Spiritually at that stage.

If Salafies still think it to be otherwise, then surely they are blaming Hadhrat Isa (as) to be a liar and also they are claiming to be contradictions in Quran.

Similarly, there are a lot more Ahadith which show that incidents will take place in Rhetorical Form on the Day of Judgement. For example, we all know that all the Prophets will surely go to Jannah. But still there are a lot of Ahadith which tell how horrible the day of Judgment will be and even all these prophets will be trembling out of fear and didn't know what will happen with them. And they also have to go through this Rhetorical Questioning.

In earlier chapters, we mentioned so many clear Quranic verses and Ahadith of Rasool Allah (saw), which make it beyond any doubt that Dead can hear. But Salafies are trying to deny all these Quranic Verses and Ahadith, only on the bases of their Conjectures.

Allahuma Sallay Allah Muhammad wa Aale Muhammad.

6. Copyright

All rights, including copyright, in the content of these Answering-Ansar.org web pages are owned or controlled for these purposes by the Answering-Ansar.org team.

You can distribute the download version of "Adobe® PDF" documents of the Answering-Ansar.org articles, as long as the documents remain in their original state and none of the contents are modified in any format.

The Answering-Ansar.org reserves the right over the contents of the articles if they are used in the original format. You can freely distribute the Islamic references and quotes that we use in our articles in any format.

When using our articles in your websites or if in distribution in print format, please include the source as Answering-Ansar.org.

Our web site contains links to third party sites. These links are used for the convenience of our users; however, they are not under the control of Answering-Ansar.org. We are not responsible for their contents, nor should they be considered endorsements of the individual linked sites.

However, it is possible that the site could contain typographical errors. If such a condition is brought to our attention, a reasonable effort will be made to fix or remove it.

If you wish to reproduce, print and distribute our articles in book format, then you will need a written permission of Answering-Ansar.org. If you wish to do so, then please contact us for further details.